

A Metasynthesis of Research on Foreign Language Teacher Identity in Turkey: Implications for Teacher Education

Türkiye’de Yabancı Dil Öğretmen Kimliği ile İlgili Araştırmaların Bir Metasentezi: Öğretmen Eğitimi için Öneriler

Gülden TANER*, A. Cendel KARAMAN**

Orta Doğu Teknik Üniversitesi

Abstract

This study explores main areas of research and identifies patterns that help interpret current tendencies in the literature on aspects related to language teacher education. For this purpose, we report the outcomes of a metasynthesis of 44 studies related to teacher identity. Conceptually, the analysis is guided by how teacher identity is framed. The structured searches in relevant databases led to conducting a particular type of systematic review known as template analysis. As a result, based on the interpretation of the data that was gathered, we identified emphasis areas in research and presented implications for teacher education. The major findings are: a) most frequently researched topic is beliefs about teaching, and b) pre-service teachers are the main group of participants focused on in research on teacher identity in Turkey. Based on the synthesis of reported findings, we underscore the need for language teacher education research focusing on issues such as *collaboration, professionalism, motivation, reflection, and culture*.

Keywords: Teacher identity, metasynthesis, foreign language teacher education, teacher education research

Öz

Bu çalışma, dil öğretmeni eğitimi ile ilgili öğeler üzerine alan yazınındaki güncel eğilimleri yorumlama hedefi doğrultusunda, ilgili araştırmaları incelemektedir. Makalede, bu amaçla, öğretmen kimliği ile ilgili öğeler içeren 44 araştırmanın metasentezinin bulguları sunulmaktadır. Bu çalışmaların incelenmesinde öğretmen kimliği kavramsal çerçevesine odaklanılmıştır. İlgili veri tabanlarında yapılan tarama sonucu, özel bir metasentez yöntemi olan şablon analizi tekniği kullanılmıştır. İnceleme sonucu öne çıkan veriler değerlendirilerek, ilgili araştırmaların yönelimleri sunulmuş ve öğretmen eğitimi için öneriler değerlendirilmiştir. Ana bulgular şunlardır: a) en sık araştırılan konu öğretim ile ilgili inançlardır; b) Türkiye’de öğretmen kimliği ilgili araştırmalarda en fazla öğretmen adayları üzerine odaklanılmaktadır. Metasentez sonucunda, bu çalışma, dil öğretmeni eğitimi araştırmalarında *işbirliği, mesleki bilinç, motivasyon, yansıtıcı düşünme*, ve *kültür* konularına olan ihtiyacı vurgulamaktadır.

Anahtar sözcükler: Öğretmen kimliği, metasentez, yabancı dil öğretmeni eğitimi, öğretmen eğitimi araştırmaları

* Araş. Gör., Orta Doğu Teknik Üniversitesi, Eğitim Fakültesi, Yabancı Diller Eğitimi Bölümü, gtaner@metu.edu.tr

** Yrd. Doç. Dr., Orta Doğu Teknik Üniversitesi, Eğitim Fakültesi, Yabancı Diller Eğitimi Bölümü, cendel@metu.edu.tr

Introduction

English language teaching plays an important role in Turkish educational system (Kırkgöz, 2007). Several aspects of the field are widely researched. In a comprehensive review of inquiries related to language teaching, Alptekin and Tatar (2011) identified main research directions in focus areas such as *language teaching and teachers*, *language learning and learners*, and *language teacher education*. In particular, studies investigating aspects of teacher education were reported to focus mainly on “pre-service and in-service teacher attitudes, beliefs, values and perceptions” and there is very little mention of *teacher identity*—an area that should be considered in teacher preparation (Alptekin and Tatar, 2011, p. 337). As Beauchamp and Thomas also noted, “gaining a more complete understanding of identity generally and teacher identity in particular could enhance the ways in which teacher education programs are conceived” (2009, p. 176).

If teacher education is considered in relation to identity formation, it should be noted that there would be processes through which teacher-learners navigate with their current identities which are subject to constant change. In this line of thinking, information on both existing and emerging identities of teacher-learners, as well as information on established professional identities of teachers, might provide valuable insights for teacher education practices, as well as for the identification of research areas that are in need of attention from the community of researchers. Taking *teacher identity* as a point of departure, this study provides a metasynthesis of 44 research studies that were published between January, 2000 and December, 2012; in order to see how the research on English language identity in Turkey evolved after the commence of the millennium, focusing on the last decade.

Purpose of the Study

The first aim of this study is to reveal the most frequently researched areas related to the language teacher identity domain in Turkey. In addition to identifying main areas of focus, by employing a systematic review of scholarly articles, we aim to depict areas that are in need of more attention in teacher identity research in the Turkish context. Furthermore, the primary focus of our study is to provide a metasynthesis of the findings reported in these studies and their implications for teacher education. In relation to these research aims, we investigate the following research questions: What are the main areas of research on ‘language teacher identity’ in the Turkish context? What are the common findings and implications of existing research on teacher identity? In line with the research questions, we will also explore common implications reported in these articles. The findings of this study, therefore, will have implications for research and teacher education programs.

To address these research questions, first, in the next section, we present a brief conceptual discussion on *teacher identity*. We also underscore how teacher identity is relevant for teacher education. This reflection will also guide the analytical process.

Theoretical Framework

Teacher Identity

For many scholars, providing a definition of teacher identity has been a controversial and complex endeavor (Ajayi, 2011; Akkerman and Meijer, 2011; Beauchamp and Thomas, 2009). On the other hand, many scholars acknowledge that recent conceptualizations move from *fixed* definitions of identity towards an approach that emphasizes a more *dynamic* view (Ajayi, 2011). As Miller (2009) noted, identity is defined “as a process of continual emerging and becoming” and is “inflected by what is legitimated by others in any social context” (p.173). In particular, students have their own conceptualizations and opinions, which

are named as 'core identity' and they also have another identity they adopt in the social context of classroom which is named as 'situated social identity' (Gee, 2001).

These considerations apply to *teachers* as well. As Miller (2009) stated, "thinking, knowing, believing, doing are enacted in classroom contexts in a way that cannot be separated from identity formation. What teachers know and do is a part of their identity work" (p.175). Some teacher education researchers frame teachers' thinking, knowing and believing as *cognition* (Borg, 2009). Clearly, based on such framings, teacher cognition is also linked to identity. Along with their socially situated identities, teachers' cognition, namely their thoughts, beliefs and knowledge constitute the constructs of teacher identity. This theoretical stance will facilitate the interpretation of the data analysis in this inquiry.

Although teacher identity and identity formation are areas of interest for teacher educators, as Crandall (2000) observed, "traditional teacher education has largely ignored the substantial set of beliefs about teaching, learning, teacher-student roles, and the like which teacher candidates bring to their program from their experiences as students and language learners" (p.38). Singh and Richards (2009) also noted that language teacher education (LTE) is not transmitting theories and practices from one context to another. Freeman and Johnson (1998) remind that "teachers are not empty vessels waiting to be filled with theoretical and pedagogical skills; they are individuals who enter teacher education programs with prior experiences, personal values, and beliefs that inform their knowledge about teaching" (p.401). Learner identity should be taken into consideration by the teachers and student identity should be starting point for teachers (Miller, 2009). Teacher-learners are also 'students' who are learning; or in other words, 'forming identity'. For this reason, in small culture of classrooms where teacher-learner identities are formed to some extent and teacher learning is embedded (Singh and Richards, 2009, p.206), their identities should be taken into consideration as well. In the next section, we present the method we employed for the systematic review and metasynthesis on research on language teacher identity in Turkey.

Method

To explore the research questions presented earlier, we conducted a systematic review of scholarly articles related to teacher identity in the Turkish context. The analytical framework relied on designing a metasynthesis utilizing 'template analysis' (King, 2007).

Metasynthesis and Template Analysis

In this study, we employed template analysis as part of conducting a metasynthesis. The template analysis method is a form of qualitative metasynthesis (Au, 2007). Metasynthesis has been defined as a research methodology which aims "to review a large body of literature and systematically synthesize the findings in an effort to develop a more informed understanding of a particular area of interest (Tang, 2009, p. 2341). With this analysis method, the content of the articles are systematically reviewed in order to identify common phenomena observed in studies, and to present key implications derived from the findings and implications reported in the literature.

Metasynthesis is considered the qualitative version of meta-analysis, which deals more with quantitative studies and combining these results (Walsh and Downe, 2005). To refer to the qualitative nature of metasynthesis, the phrase 'qualitative meta-synthesis' was first coined by Stern and Harris (1985, as cited in Walsh and Downe, 2005) to refer to an "amalgamation of a group of qualitative studies (p.204). While Walsh and Downe (2005) focused only on the inclusion of qualitative studies, Bair (1999) included findings of quantitative studies in his metasynthesis, as well as the qualitative ones. As in all other research activities, an important issue in conducting metasynthesis is that, there should be "an appropriate research question, purpose or aim" (Walsh and Downe, 2005, p. 206). In addition, in the selection of data to be used for metasynthesis, there is a need that "the criteria for both the inclusion and

exclusion of primary research studies be clearly stated" (Welch, 2008, p. 33). The criteria for inclusion and exclusion used in this study will be presented in the next section.

While conducting a metasynthesis, once the purpose is set and data is selected, template analysis—the main data analysis procedure—can be employed. Template analysis is a qualitative form of inquiry for thematically analyzing any kind of textual data; which requires basically the steps of: a) defining some *a priori* themes, b) producing an initial template, c) developing the final template, d) interpreting findings, e) doing a quality check to ensure reliability and validity of research (King, 2007). We present the steps of template analysis used in this study in the next section.

Data Sources and Analysis Procedure

In the first phase of the metasynthesis, i.e. problem formulation stage, two research questions were formulated related to a) the main areas of research on teacher identity in Turkey, b) the common findings and implications for teacher education. Furthermore, in line with the research questions, some *a priori* themes were identified at the first stage of template analysis. These themes were the concepts that were expected to be encountered in a search about teacher identity; namely, *identity, attitude and/or belief, and knowledge*. These codes were derived from related work on language teacher cognition (Borg, 2009) and teacher identity (Miller, 2009).

The second phase of metasynthesis involved a compilation of data (ie. gathering the articles for metasynthesis through a database search). The data included in this study were gathered through database searches conducted on Middle East Technical University (METU) Library Network in December, 2012. In order to eliminate unintended exclusion of relevant data because of the use of a specific search, and in order to obtain as many results as possible; a general term was used as the search query, and then the limiters presented in the next paragraph were applied.

With the query "language teacher", we conducted both Boolean and smart-text database searches on the databases of; *Academic Search Complete, ERIC, FRANCIS, Educational Search Complete, Education Source, and ULAKBIM Turkish National Databases on EBSCOHost® engine*, accessed through METU Library. The query was looked for in the titles and abstracts of the publications. The expander for the searches was "apply related words" option, which also retrieved results including "instructor" for example, when the query was "teacher". We also applied some limiters to retrieve relevant results. These limiters were in time, publication type and geography: the results were geographically limited to Turkey, and publication date was limited to be between Jan, 2000 and Dec, 2012; and the results were refined only to include peer-reviewed scholarly articles.

With these options, the initial Boolean search yielded 127 results, and smart-text search led to 155 items. When the results were combined and duplicates were removed, 170 articles were left in the data set. These items were analyzed for the occurrences of *a priori* themes, and for relevance to "teacher identity". We excluded articles which did not relate to these themes, and final data set included 44 articles. An analysis was run on the titles of remaining 44 articles and with the help of *a priori* themes, an initial template was developed. This initial template included the following items:

Table 1
Initial Template For The Analysis Of Data

Teacher Identity (Miller)	Construction of Identity	Impact of TE programs	
		Impact of Social Context	
		Impact of Practice	
		Impact of Collaboration	
Teacher Identity (Miller)	Teacher cognition (Borg)	Beliefs about	Learning and learners
			Teaching practices
			Teaching profession
			Teacher education
		Knowledge of teachers	Content knowledge
			Methodological knowledge
			Development

After the production of the initial template, a “quality check” was done. King (2007) suggests that quality check is to ensure reliability and validity of the analysis. As part of this quality check, we repeated the same steps of data collection as described below:

The database search on same databases with same expanders and limiters and with the same query gave the same results. In the second phase of the quality check, the list of articles was reviewed by two researchers, to decide on the relevant and irrelevant studies. In this second coding of articles for relevance, researchers decided either to include or exclude the articles. Two researchers agreed in their decisions on 157 items (either to include or exclude), among 170 items in the article list. We found that the inter-coder reliability rate at this stage was satisfactory. The inter-coder reliability score was found to be .92; which marks a high inter-rater reliability. Abstracts of the disagreed 13 items were read for identification of relevance, and they were all found to be irrelevant. The number of relevant and therefore included articles is 44, which verifies the results of the first search and thus validates the search.

In review of the articles for the second time, the two researchers reviewed the produced initial template together and revised some constructs. After the revision of initial template, we re-defined some codes and organized the layout to ensure practicality of coding. Table 2 presents the final form of the template we used in the template analysis.

Table 2
Final Form Of The Template Used In The Analysis Of Data

TEACHER COGNITION							
Situated Identity (social effects on identity) (SI)				Beliefs (BEL)			Knowledge (KNOW)
In Teacher Education Program	in Teaching Practice and/or Practicum	in Collaboration	Profession	about Learning	about Teaching	about Teacher Education Program	
(TEPROG)	(PRAC)	(COL)	(PROF)	(LEA)	(TEA)	(TEPROG)	

In the template, there are three constructs of teacher cognition. These are situated identity, beliefs and/or attitudes, and knowledge. These three domains have other sub-categories. For instance, when an

article is coded as BELLEA, SITEPROG; this means that that article contains information about teachers' beliefs about learning, and teachers' situated identity construction in relation to teacher education program. By this coding scheme, it is possible to cover a wide range of studies in a certain field of study.

Findings

In this section, we discuss the findings of the study with reference to the research questions.

What are the main domains of research on 'language teacher identity' in Turkish context?

To begin with, the effect size of the data might give some inferences about the areas of interest in teacher identity research. 2369 pre-service teachers were included in the studies analyzed, while in-service teachers were 1404, 13 teacher educators, 359 mentors were involved. Of these 44 listed, 26 articles (60%) included pre-service teachers as participants, while only 13 articles (29%) included in-service teachers.

We also studied the data collection tools used in the studies. 23 of the studies used questionnaires (or surveys), 20 of them included interviews, 6 articles included journals and 5 studies relied on observations. These tools are often combined for triangulation. The most frequently utilized data collection tools are questionnaires or surveys.

The most commonly identified theme in these studies was "teacher beliefs". This was observed in 31 articles, which makes up 70% of the data set. This is followed by "teacher knowledge" and "social identity in profession". These were both seen in 19 articles, which make up the 43% of the data set. The theme "teachers' beliefs about learning" occurs 16 times, or in other words, in approximately 36% of the data. It is followed by "beliefs about teacher education or TE programs" and "situated/social identity in practicum/practice" with 10 items each. The least frequent themes were also identified. These were: "situated identity in collaboration" and "situated identity in TE programs" with 9 occurrences each.

Overall number of studies that go under belief categories is 39, which means that 39 out of the 44 articles in the data set include at least one of the themes listed under "beliefs". In other words, 88,6% of the studies related to beliefs the teachers had.

The other construct, teacher cognition (Borg, 2009), was addressed in 19 studies, i.e. 41% of the articles. There was only one study which focused merely on teacher knowledge. On the other hand, the social constructs of teacher identity, the situated or social identity themes, were observed in the 71% of the data set, or in 31 articles. Among constructs related to teacher identity, research seems to be concerned mainly with teachers' beliefs in the Turkish context.

The findings suggest that new research is needed in some areas which could not attract enough attention from Turkish scholars yet. The implications for research will be discussed in greater detail in the implications part.

What are the common findings and implications of existing research on teacher identity?

To answer the second research question, a synthesis needed to be generated. For this purpose, we examined the implications of articles listed in the data set. The findings and discussion parts of these studies mostly centered around *needs assessment for ensuring motivation, ensuring better conceptualization of knowledge, developing a sense of professionalism, collaboration, addressing culture in teacher education, reflective practices and awareness raising*.

Many studies found that prospective teachers lacked knowledge of other cultures, and interest in learning the cultural aspects of teaching. Educating teachers on how culture should be dealt with in

teaching, definitions of intercultural communication, and cultural aspects of teaching is another implication underscored in relation to teacher education practices.

Motivation, the need to increase prospective teachers' sense of professionalism, addressing deficiencies in prospective teachers' knowledge and tailoring teaching practices to the needs of prospective teachers in order to motivate them in their development process were observed to be among the areas discussions mainly centered around.

Practicum is emphasized by researchers since it is the first authentic experiential step towards the profession. Practicum is an important component of any teacher education program that awaits further attention in terms of providing more experience and feedback for prospective teachers.

Another area of emphasis was reflection. One way of developing prospective teachers' knowledge, sense of professionalism and motivating them is helping them become aware of what they do, through reflection and research. The importance of reflective practices is emphasized again in conducted studies.

In the next section, we discuss these in relation to implications for teacher education, along with general implications drawn for directions of research. In presenting the discussion of issues, following the structure proposed by Cooper (2009), we refer to a summary of major findings of metasynthesis, present their interpretation, and provide implications for further research.

Discussion and Implications

The synthesis of data showed a tendency in research towards mainly studying beliefs, and towards beliefs about teaching. There is an abundance of questionnaires investigating beliefs; and a tendency to replicate such studies or adapt instruments. On the other hand, 'identity construction in collaboration' and 'identity construction in teacher education' were areas that attracted the least interest. These findings also match the findings of Alptekin and Tatar's (2011) study in which research patterns related to language teaching and teachers, language learning and learners and language teacher education were identified. One implication therefore, is that there is need for further research on teachers' identity construction. For research on identity, due to its complex dynamic nature, the needs for research design vary. Researchers need to explore new possibilities for situated research in this domain. Furthermore, identity research is a newly emerging area (Miller, 2009) for which there is still the need for clarification of tools and methods for inquiry.

Another key finding of this study is that there is very limited research focusing on teacher educators. While large numbers of mentors are listed as participants in several studies, there were only two studies that included mentors as focal participants. In the field of teacher education, there is need for more research on mentors and collaborating teachers, as well as teacher educators and their practices. Teacher educators are the key role players in teacher identity construction; which entails, therefore, that focusing on teacher educators in future research could contribute both to literature and teacher education practices.

Practicum experience, culture knowledge, reflection and motivation were the most frequently discussed themes in the data set. The important role of practicum component in forming teacher identity reflects itself in existing literature focusing on teacher education (e.g. Ramsden, 1992; Smith & Lev-Ari, 2005). Tuli and File (2009) argues that practicum practices have a strong role in forming pre-service teachers' identities since they are more real when compared to the experience student-teachers have during their teacher training program. In the light of these, the findings imply that teacher education programs should make practicum experience more meaningful for the students by making practices more *real-like*. Mentors

need to be trained and there should be a continuing collaboration between mentors and teacher educators. Since practicum is among the first experiential learning opportunities for teaching, it is a key domain to be explored in relation to teacher identity formation.

With reference to the emphasis in the findings about culture education, the findings show that the prospective language teachers need training in cultural aspects. Teacher education programs and teacher educators might provide tools and resources for student teachers to better understand other cultures as well as cultural aspects of teaching.

Motivation was found to be an important construct discussed in the literature. As stated before, common findings were the need to increase prospective teachers' sense of professionalism; to address deficiencies in prospective teachers' knowledge; and to tailor teaching practices to the needs of prospective teachers in order to motivate them in their development process. These are valuable implications for teacher educators and teacher education program developers to consider in order to meet the expectations of student teachers.

Overall, based on these areas of emphasis, areas of deficiency identified in these studies and suggested actions need to be reflected on. A major implication of this study is the need for reflecting on teacher education practices and developing teacher education programs that take into account all the necessities identified in current teacher identity research.

Conclusion

When the substantial body of research is to be used optimally for the field it is related to, metasynthesis might provide a valuable tool for the researchers. This study reported on a metasynthesis of 44 scholarly reviewed articles gathered through database search. The systematically selected articles were analyzed through a template analysis method. This study aimed to combine the research information in a systematic way to provide syntheses of specific studies and to explore implications for improving teacher education practices. The study is still limited in that it does not include other academic work such as theses and dissertations, conference proceedings and review papers. In addition, this study might have been broadened by inclusion of other work cited in the articles in data set. This limitation of the study can be addressed with further research. The period the study focused on can be another limitation to its contribution to the field: further research extending the time frame to include previous decades rather than limiting it to a period of 12 years might provide more insights as to identify the research patterns and tendencies observed in existing literature on teacher identity in Turkey.

Main aim of this metasynthesis was to identify main flows of research on language teacher identity in the Turkish context and to conglomerate their results in order to explore implications for teacher education practices and research. Teacher beliefs were found to be the most researched area, with pre-service teachers being on the focus of researchers. Furthermore, the findings of the articles included in the data set were synthesized to construct common implications for future research. The highlighted themes included *the importance of practicum, motivation, and reflection* in teacher identity formation.

References

- Ajayi, L. (2011). How ESL teachers' sociocultural identities mediate their teacher role identities in a diverse urban school setting. *The Urban Review*, Volume 43, Issue 5, pp 654-680.
- Akkerman, S. F., & Meijer, P. C. (2011). A dialogical approach to conceptualizing teacher identity. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 27(2), pp. 308-319.
- Alptekin, C. & Tatar, S.(2011). Research on foreign language teaching and learning in Turkey (2005–2009). *Language Teaching*, 44, pp 328-353 doi:10.1017/S026144481100005X
- *Altan, M. (2012). Pre-service EFL teachers' beliefs about foreign language learning. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 35(4), 481-493. doi:10.1080/02619768.2011.643399
- *Ankan, A. (2010). Effective English language teacher from the perspectives of prospective and in-service teachers in Turkey. *Electronic Journal of Social Sciences*, 9(31), 209-223.
- *Arioğul, S. (2009). İngiliz dili öğretmen adaylarının akademik motivasyonları. (Turkish). *Hacettepe University Journal of Education*, (36), 12-19.
- *Atay, D. (2005). Reflections on the cultural dimension of language teaching. *Language & Intercultural Communication*, 5(3/4), 222-236.
- *Atay, D. (2006). Teachers' Professional Development: Partnerships in Research. *Tesl-Ej*, 10(2), 1-15.
- *Atay, D., Kurt, G., Çamlıbel, Z., Ersin, P., & Kashioglu, Ö. (2009). The role of intercultural competence in foreign language teaching. *Inonu University Journal of the Faculty of Education (INUJFE)*, 10(3), 123-135.
- Au, W. (2007) High-stakes testing and curricular control: a qualitative metasynthesis, *Educational Researcher*, 36 (5) pp. 258–267.
- *Ayan, D., & Seferoğlu, G. (2011). Using electronic portfolios to promote reflective thinking in language teacher education. *Educational Studies (03055698)*, 37(5), 513-521. doi:10.1080/03055698.2010.539782
- *Aydın, B. (2008). An e-class application in a Distance English Language Teacher Training program (DELTT): Turkish learners' perceptions. *Interactive Learning Environments*, 16(2), 157-168. doi:10.1080/10494820701343900
- Bair, C. R. (1999). Meta-synthesis. Paper presented at the *Annual Meeting of the Association for the Study of Higher Education*, November 18-21.
- Beauchamp, C. & Thomas, L. (2009) Understanding teacher identity: An overview of issues in the literature and implications for teacher education. *Cambridge Journal of Education* Vol. 39, No. 2, June 2009, 175–189
- *Bekleyen, N. (2011). Can I teach English to children? Turkish preservice teacher candidates and very young learners. *Journal of Early Childhood Teacher Education*, 32(3), 256-265. doi:10.1080/10901027.2011.594700
- Borg, S. (2009). Language teacher cognition. In Burns, A. and Richards, J.C. (Eds.), *The Cambridge Guide to Second Language Teacher Education* (pp.163-171). New York: Cambridge University Press.
- *Büyükyavuz, O., & İnal, S. (2008). A descriptive study on Turkish teachers of English regarding their professional needs, efforts for development and available resources. *Asian EFL Journal*, 10(3), 215-233.

- *Canbay, O., & Beceren, S. (2012). Conceptions of teaching held by the instructors in English language teaching departments. *Turkish Online Journal of Qualitative Inquiry*, 3(3), 71-81.
- *Çelik, S. (2012). The role of foreign-educated scholars in turkey's higher education system: a narrative study of two English language teacher educators. *Turkish Online Journal of Qualitative Inquiry*, 3(3), 56-70.
- Crandall, J. (2000). Language teacher education. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics* 20, pp.34-55.
- Cooper, H. (2010). *Research Synthesis and Meta-Analysis*. (4th ed.). California: Sage.
- *Deniz, S. (2010). Student teachers' evaluation of the motivational strategies used in foreign language teaching. *Social Behavior & Personality: An International Journal*, 38(9), 1269-1286. doi:10.2224/sbp.2010.38.9.1269
- Freeman, D & Johnson, K.E. (1998). Reconceptualizing the knowledge-base of language teacher education. *TESOL Quarterly*, Vol. 32, No. 3, pp. 397-417.
- Gee, J. P. (2001). Identity as an analytic lens for research in education. *Review of Research in Education*, 25, pp. 99-125.
- *Genç, G. (2010). İngilizce öğretmenlerinin mesleki gelişim sürecinin önünde algıladıkları başlıca engeller. (Turkish). *Electronic Journal of Social Sciences*, 9(31), 103-117.
- *Göçer, A. (2010). A qualitative research on the teaching strategies and class applications of the high school teachers who teach English in Turkey as a foreign language. *Education*, 131(1), 196-219.
- *Gün, B. (2010). Are teachers fully prepared to teach different varieties of English: a case study in Turkey. *Journal of English as an International Language*, 5164-175.
- *Gürbüz, N. (2012). What makes a language teacher competent? : a case study on pre-service English language teachers' reflections. *Ekev Academic Review*, 16(52), 219-230.
- *Karaata, C. (2011). Assumptions and pedagogical knowledge: teaching and learning according to teachers of English. *Hacettepe University Journal Of Education*, (41), 244-254.
- *Kavanoz, S. (2006). An exploratory study of English language teachers' beliefs, assumptions, and knowledge about learner-centeredness. *Turkish Online Journal Of Educational Technology*, 5(2), 3-9.
- *Keränen, N., & Bayyurt, Y. (2006). Intercultural telecollaboration: in-service EFL teachers in Mexico and pre-service EFL teachers in Turkey. *Tesl-Ej*, 10(3), 1-50.
- King, N. (2007). Template analysis. Retrieved from: http://hhs.hud.ac.uk/w2/research/template_analysis/
- Kırkgöz, Y. (2007). English language teaching in Turkey: policy changes and their implementations *RELC Journal* 2007 38: 216 DOI: 10.1177/0033688207079696
- *Kızılaslan, İ., & Diktaş, İ. (2011). The role of university education in changing the gender role perceptions of Turkish ELT student teachers. *International Online Journal of Educational Sciences*, 3(2), 510-525.
- *Kızıldağ, A. (2009). Teaching English in Turkey: Dialogues with teachers about the challenges in public primary schools. *International Electronic Journal of Elementary Education*, 1(3), 188-201.
- *Koç, E. (2012). Idiographic roles of cooperating teachers as mentors in pre-service distance teacher education. *Teaching & Teacher Education*, 28(6), 818-826. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2012.03.007
- *Koçoğlu, Z. (2011). Emotional intelligence and teacher efficacy: a study of Turkish EFL pre-service teachers. *Teacher Development*, 15(4), 471-484. doi:10.1080/13664530.2011.642647

- *Kömür, Ş. (2011). The effect of learning style preference on course achievement among preservice English teachers. *Problems of Education In The 21st Century*, 2971-81.
- *Kurt, G., & Atay, D. (2007). The effects of peer feedback on the writing anxiety of prospective Turkish teachers of EFL. *Journal of Theory & Practice in Education (JTPE)*, 3(1), 12-23.
- *Mathews-Aydinli, J., & Elaziz, F. (2010). Turkish students' and teachers' attitudes toward the use of interactive whiteboards in EFL classrooms. *Computer Assisted Language Learning*, 23(3), 235-252. doi:10.1080/09588221003776781
- *Merç, A. (2011). Sources of Foreign Language Student Teacher Anxiety: A Qualitative Inquiry. *Turkish Online Journal Of Qualitative Inquiry*, 2(4), 80-94.
- Miller, J. (2009). Teacher identity. In Burns, A. and Richards, J.C. (Eds.), *The Cambridge Guide to Second Language Teacher Education* (pp.172-181). New York: Cambridge University Press.
- *Mitton-Kükner, J., & Akyüz, Ç. (2012). Burrowing into the reciprocal learning collaboration of two instructors in an English-medium university in Turkey. *Teacher Development*, 16(4), 425-442. doi:10.1080/13664530.2012.717213
- *Nergis, A. (2011). Grammar Teaching Beliefs of a Pre-service Teacher: A Repertory Grid Analysis. *Sino-US English Teaching*, 8(1), 1-14.
- *Özmen, K. (2011). Analyzing washback effect of SEPPPO* on prospective English teachers. *Journal of Language & Linguistics Studies*, 7(2), 24-51.
- *Öztürk, H., Çeçen, S., & Altınmakas, D. (2010). How do non-native pre-service English language teachers perceive ELF?: A qualitative study. *Journal of English As An International Language*, 5137-146.
- Ramsden, P. (1992) *Learning to Teach in Higher Education*. London: Routledge.
- *Saraç Süzer, H. (2007). Teacher knowledge on grammar teaching: a case study. *Hacettepe University Journal of Education*, (32), 255-265.
- *Seferoğlu, G. (2004). A study of alternative English teacher certification practices in Turkey. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 30(2), 151-159.
- *Seferoğlu, G. (2006). Teacher candidates' reflections on some components of a pre-service English teacher education programme in Turkey. *Journal Of Education For Teaching*, 32(4), 369-378. doi:10.1080/02607470600981953
- Singh, G & Richards, J.C.. (2009). Teaching and learning in the course room. In Burns, A. and Richards, J.C. (Eds.), *The Cambridge Guide to Second Language Teacher Education* (pp.201-208). New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Smith, K., & Lev-Ari, L. (2005). The place of the practicum in pre-service teacher education: The voice of the students. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education*, 33,3, 289-302.
- *Stelma, J., & Onat-Stelma, Z. (2010). Foreign language teachers organising learning during their first year of teaching young learners. *Language Learning Journal*, 38(2), 193-207. doi:10.1080/09571731003790490
- Tang, X. (2009). Qualitative meta-synthesis techniques for analysis of public opinions for in-depth study. Proceedings from: *Complex Sciences, First International Conference*, Shanghai, China, February 23-25, 2009. Revised papers, part 2.

- Tuli, F. & File, G. (2009). Practicum experience in teacher education. *Ethiopian Journal of Education and Sciences*, 5(1), 107-116.
- *Turhan, ı., & Arıkan, A. (2009). English language teacher development with and without a teacher trainer: ELT instructors' perceptions. *E-Journal of New World Sciences Academy (NWSA)*, 4(2), 410-421.
- Walsh, D. & Downe, S. (2005). Meta-synthesis method for qualitative research: a literature review. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 50(2), pp. 204–211
- Welch, S. (2008). Metasynthesis of the transition from novice to expert: can instructional interventions shorten the process? (Doctoral Dissertation) ProQuest, Capella University.
- *Woods, D., & Çakır, H. (2011). Two dimensions of teacher knowledge: the case of communicative language teaching. *System*, 39(3), 381-390. doi:10.1016/j.system.2011.07.010
- *Yavuz, A. (2007). Understanding student teachers' effectiveness through journals at an English language teaching department: a Turkish university case. *Mediterranean Journal Of Educational Studies*, 12(2), 19-43.
- *Yavuz, A. (2011). The problematic context of mentoring: evidence from an English language teaching department at a Turkish university. *European Journal Of Teacher Education*, 34(1), 43-59. doi:10.1080/02619768.2010.516431
- *Yaylı, D. (2012). Professional language use by pre-service English as a foreign language teachers in a teaching certificate program. *Teachers & Teaching*, 18(1), 59-73. doi:10.1080/13540602.2011.622555
- *Yıldırım, Ö. (2008). Pre-service English Teachers' Views of Teacher and Student Responsibilities in the Foreign Language Classroom. *Eurasian Journal Of Educational Research (EJER)*, (33), 211-226.
- *Yıldırım, O. (2010). Washback effects of a high-stakes university entrance exam: effects of the English section of the university entrance exam on future English language teachers in Turkey. *Asian EFL Journal*, 12(2), 92-116.
- *Yılmaz, C. (2011). Teachers' perceptions of self-efficacy, English proficiency, and instructional strategies. *Social Behavior & Personality: An International Journal*, 39(1), 91-100. doi:10.2224/sbp.2011.39.1.91

* The citations indicated with an asterisk (*) are included in metasynthesis.

Geniş Özet

Türkiye’de Yabancı Dil Öğretmen Kimliği ile İlgili Araştırmaların Bir Metasentezi: Öğretmen Eğitimi için Öneriler

Öğretmen eğitimi alanında yürütülen araştırma ve çalışmalar; öğretmen adaylarının öğretmenlik eğitimi boyunca şekillenen kimlikleri hakkında bilgi sahibi olmak, kimlik gelişiminin daha iyi gözlemlenebilmesi ve öğretmen yetiştiren programların iyileştirilmesi açısından oldukça büyük önem taşımaktadır. Öğretmen eğitimi, öğretmen kimliğinin oluşmasındaki ilk basamak olarak ele alınacak olursa; öğretmen yetiştiren eğitim programları ve öğretmen adayları ile ilgili çalışmaların öğretmen kimliğinin nasıl oluştuğuna ışık tutacağı düşünülebilir. Türkiye’de yapılan çok sayıda araştırmanın sonuçlarını sentezleyerek yabancı dil öğretmeni eğitimi uygulamalarını ele almak, yabancı dil öğretmeni eğitimi ve öğretmen kimliği alanında en çok çalışılan ve çalışılması gereken alanları belirlemek, çalışmaların ortak bulguları ve önerilerini tartışarak yabancı dil öğretmeni yetiştiren akademisyenlere katkı sağlamak amacıyla; bu çalışmada Ocak 2000 ve Aralık 2012 tarihleri arasında akademik dergilerde yayınlanan yabancı dil öğretmeni ve öğretmen kimliği ile ilgili 44 makalenin metasentezi yapılmıştır.

Çalışmamızın temelini oluşturan metasentez, Walsh ve Downe (2005) tarafından nitel çalışmaların analizi olarak tanımlansa da Bair (1999) metasentez çalışmalarında hem nitel hem de nicel çalışmaları bir arada kullanmıştır. Bu çalışma da, özel bir metasentez yöntemi olan şablon analizi (King, 2007) tekniğini kullanarak hem nitel hem nicel verilere dayanan çalışmaların bir sentezini sunmaktadır. Bu yöntemle göre, metasentezin ilk aşamasında a) Türkiye’de öğretmenlik kimliği ile ilgili temel araştırma alanları ve b) öğretmen eğitimi uygulamaları için ortak bulgu ve önerilerin belirlenmesi ile ilgili araştırma soruları oluşturulmuştur. Araştırma sorularını cevaplamak üzere, öğretmenlik kimliği ile ilgili mevcut alan yazınına dayanılarak öncül (*a priori*) temalar ortaya konmuştur. Bu temalar, öğretmen kimliği ile ilgili çalışmalarda görülmesi muhtemel olan anahtar sözcüklerden oluşur; bunlar, kimlik, tutum ve/veya inanç ve bilgi olarak belirlenmiştir.

Orta Doğu Teknik Üniversitesi Kütüphane Ağı üzerinden, 2012 Aralık ayı içerisinde EBSCOHost® veritabanı tarama motoru üzerinden *Academic Search Complete*, *ERIC*, *FRANCIS*, *Educational Search Complete*, *Education Source* ve *ULAKBIM Turkish National Databases* veritabanlarında, Ocak 2000- Aralık 2012 tarihleri arasında yayınlanmış makaleler taranmıştır. Tarama, meslektaş değerlendirmesi kriterine dayalı dergilerde yayınlanan yabancı dil öğretmenliği ile ilgili akademik makaleleri içerecek şekilde sonuçlandırılmıştır. Elde edilen 170 makalelik veri kümesi, araştırmacılar tarafından öncül temalar ışığında incelenerek, sadece öğretmenlik kimliği ile ilgili makaleleri içerecek şekilde daraltılmıştır. Sonuçta elde edilen veri kümesinde 44 makale bulunmaktadır. Makalelerin seçiminde kullanılan öncül tema değerlendirmesi sırasında araştırmacılar arası uyuma düzeyi .92 olarak belirlenmiştir; bu değer makale seçiminde güvenilirliğe işaret etmektedir.

Veri kümesi üzerinde kodlama işlemlerinin yapılabilmesi için bir sonraki aşamada alan yazına dayanılarak ilk kod şablonu oluşturulmuştur. Miller (2009) öğretmenin bilgi, düşünce, inanç ve deneyimlerini öğretmen kimliğinin bir parçası olarak tanımlar. Öte yandan, Borg (2009) öğretmenlerin bilgi, düşünce ve inançlarını öğretmenlerin bilişsel durumu altında toplar ve bunu öğretmen kimliğinin bir parçası olarak görür. Bu bağlamda, çalışmamızda öğretmenlik kimliği ile ilgili teoriye dayanılarak oluşturulan ilk kodlar iki grup altında toplanmıştır. Öğretmenin biliş durumu başlığı altında öğretmenlik, öğrenciler, meslek ve öğretmen eğitimi ile ilgili inançlar, içerik ve yöntem bilgisi ve bilginin edinilmesi ile

ilgili kodlar; öğretmenlik kimliğinin oluşturulması bağlamında da eğitim programlarının, sosyal çevrenin, uygulama ve işbirliğinin etkisi ile ilgili kodlar bulunmaktadır.

İlk kod şablonunun oluşturulmasından sonra, önceki aşamalar en baştan tekrarlanarak kalite denetimi yapılmış ve tutarlılık sağlanmıştır. Daha sonra, belirlenen 44 makalenin ilk okumasında kodlar yeniden düzenlenmiştir. Düzenlenen kodları içeren son kod şablonu makale içerisinde Tablo 2’de görülebilir.

Veri kümesi ikinci okumada son şablona göre kodlanmış ve araştırma soruları cevaplanmıştır. Veri kümesinde yer alan çalışmaların etki boyutu hesaplandığında, metasentezin alana katkısı bir kez daha görülebilir. Buna göre, metasentezi yapılan çalışmalarda toplam 2369 öğretmen adayı, 1404 öğretmen, 13 öğretmen eğitimcisi, 359 mentor öğretmenden oluşan bir katılımcı kitlesi yer almıştır. Araştırmalarda başta anket olmak üzere sözlü mülakat, günlük ve gözlem en çok kullanılan veri toplama araçlarıdır.

Metasentez sonucunda, yabancı dil öğretmeni kimliği ile ilgili araştırmaların en çok öğretim uygulamaları ile ilgili inançlar üzerinde yoğunlaştığı (%70) ve bunu “bilgi” ve “meslekte sosyal kimlik” temalarının izlediği görülmüştür. 44 çalışmadan 39’u öğretmenlerin öğretme, öğrenme ve öğretmen eğitimi ile ilgili tutumları üzerinde yoğunlaşmıştır. Öğretmen kimliğinin sosyal boyutu da sık karşılaşılan başka bir çalışma alanıdır.

Çalışmaların bulgular ve öneriler kısımları incelendiğinde, genellikle motivasyon sağlama amaçlı ihtiyaç analizi, bilginin daha iyi kavramlaştırılması, profesyonel bir anlayış geliştirilmesi, işbirliği, öğretmen eğitiminde kültürel konular, yansıtıcı uygulamalar ve farkındalık yaratılması gibi konulara yoğunlaşıldığı görülmüştür.

Bu çalışma, öğretmen kimliği oluşumu ve öğretmen eğitimi uygulamalarının Türkiye’de araştırmaların yeterince odağında olmadığını ortaya koymuş ve bu alanda yapılacak çalışmalara duyulan ihtiyacı gündeme getirmiştir. Aynı zamanda, veri kümesinde en çok tartışılan konular arasında olan staj, öğretmen eğitimi uygulamalarının daha ‘gerçekçi’ olması gerektiğini göstermiştir. Yansıtıcı yaklaşım ve motivasyon konuları da alan yazında önemli yer tutmaktadır. Bu bilgiler ışığında, öğretmenlik uygulamaları ile ilgili derslere önem verilmesi, öğrencilerin ihtiyaçlarının göz önünde bulundurularak öğretmenlik eğitimi için daha fazla motivasyon sağlanması ve yansıtıcı yaklaşım ile mesleki gelişim sağlanması dikkate değer noktalardır.

İncelenen makalelerde öğretmen adaylarının profesyonel kimliklerinin oluşumunda motivasyon, bilgi, bilişsel beceri ve kültür eğitiminin etkisi de gözlemlenmiştir; bu bulgular öğretmen eğitimi uygulamalarının iyileştirilmesi için önemli bir katkı niteliğindedir. Bu çalışmanın en önemli sonucu, öğretmen kimliği ile ilgili çalışmalarda ortaya konan ihtiyaçları göz önünde bulunduran öğretmen yetiştirme programları geliştirilmesi ve öğretmen eğitimi uygulamaları üzerine daha çok düşünülmesi konularındaki gerekliliğe dikkat çekmesidir.